



C U Y A M A C A
• C O L L E G E •

Comprehensive Program Review Report

Academic - Business Office Technology (BOT) - (CE)

Program Goals

Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs. (Goal 1)

Program Goal: Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs.

Goal Status: Active

Mapping

2022 - 2028 Strategic Plan: (X)

- **Eliminate Equity Gaps in Course Success:** Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs. (X)
- **Increase Completion and Eliminate Equity Gaps:** Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs. (X)
- **Increase Equitable Access:** Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs. (X)
- **Increase Persistence and Eliminate Equity Gaps:** Promote and encourage equity training opportunities to all faculty for either first-time or ongoing training needs. (X)

Summary of Progress or Results
<p>Summary Date: 10/22/2024</p> <p>Summary of Progress or Results: We encourage instructors to participate. Carryover to next year.</p> <p>Reporting Period: 2024 - 2025</p> <p>Status: In Progress - will carry forward into next year</p> <p>Action steps for this academic year.: We encourage faculty to participate in equity-minded training and are looking to have a cohort participate in the Equity Pedagogy and Practice Academy, or something similar.</p>

Bi-lingual tutors

Program Goal: Hire bi-lingual embedded tutors with a special emphasis on Hispanic populations

Goal Status: Active

Mapping

2022 - 2028 Strategic Plan: (X)

- **Eliminate Equity Gaps in Course Success:** Hire bi-lingual embedded tutors with a special emphasis on Hispanic populations (X)
- **Increase Completion and Eliminate Equity Gaps:** Hire bi-lingual embedded tutors with a special emphasis on Hispanic populations (X)
- **Increase Persistence and Eliminate Equity Gaps:** Hire bi-lingual embedded tutors with a special emphasis on Hispanic populations (X)

Program Goals

Summary of Progress or Results

Summary Date: 10/31/2024

Summary of Progress or Results: New goal

Reporting Period: 2024 - 2025

Status: In Progress - will carry forward into next year

Action steps for this academic year.:

We recently hired a bi-lingual (English/Spanish) instructor but have not found such a bi-lingual tutor yet.

Program Overview and Update

Lead Author

Angham Yousif

Collaborator(s)

Hadar Ikzir, Aseel Hanna, Annie Zuckerman, Marisela Cobian, Diana Jacobs, Layla Shaba, Alex Needleman

Initial Collaboration Date with Program Team

06/19/2024

Dean/Manager(s)

George Dowden

Initial Collaboration Date with Dean

11/01/2024

Program Reflection and Description

Provide your program's mission statement. If your program does not have a mission statement, what is your timeline for creating a mission statement?

The mission of Business Office Technology is to prepare students for employment and advancement in today's business offices which are technology intensive. The curriculum has been planned to accommodate a variety of needs and career paths, and is also appropriate for those wishing to update computer skills.

Is the program description in the current college catalog up to date and accurate?

Yes

Describe how your program advances the College's vision of equity, excellence, and social justice through education. How does the program reflect the College's mission and values?

The BOT program supports the mission and values of the college and advances the college's vision of equity, excellence, and social justice by providing instruction in a career education field that provides an array of jobs. This, in turn, promotes economic and civic development. BOT is student focused and provides career education training for those seeking jobs, as well as those continuing to a four-year college to earn a bachelor's degree. BOT graduates have articulated pathways at University of Phoenix and Point Loma Nazarene University.

Curriculum Review and Development

Have all of your active course outlines been reviewed within the last five years?

Yes

Please list any planned changes from the current semester forward for curriculum (courses, degrees, and/or certificates) and the rationale for those changes.

None at this time

For Transfer Programs: How is your program meeting the transfer needs of students, and/or articulation with four-year institutions? If not a transfer program, please enter N/A

N/A

For Career Education Programs: How is your program meeting labor market demand and preparing students to enter the workforce? If not a career education program, please enter N/A

The Business Office Technology curriculum prepares students for employment and advancement in today's technology intensive office. The curriculum has been planned to accommodate a variety of needs and career paths. In addition to traditional office skills, students will acquire proficiency in using computers and current software to perform a variety of essential administrative functions. Graduates of the program will be prepared to work with management in all types of business environments. With additional training at a baccalaureate level college or university, students may prepare for a position in business education or business management.

Comprehensive Program Review

Students wishing to earn an associate degree select an area of emphasis in either Business Office Technology, Administrative Assistant or Executive Assistant. Some students do not want the associate degree, so a certificate of achievement is another option for the areas mentioned above. A certificate can be earned in less time than an associate degree. The Business Office Technology degree is for those who seek work in a general business office, not necessarily as an office assistant. The Administrative Assistant curriculum is designed for students who wish to acquire the skills necessary for entry to mid-level administrative support position. The Executive Assistant curriculum is designed for students who wish to prepare themselves for a mid- to upper-level administrative support position or to advance in their current company. The Executive Assistant curriculum also prepares students to take the Microsoft Office Specialist (MOS) certification examination.

Student Learning Outcomes (SLO) Assessment

Please upload an updated, current version of your SLO assessment plan. (Ideally, the updated plan should specify assessment semesters for all service areas over the next 4 years, between this comprehensive program review and the next.)

[BOT SLO Assessment Plan - Rev Angham 2024.xlsx](#)

What do your SLO data suggest about student experiences, successes, and challenges in your service area?

Overall BOT students are experiencing success in their courses as shown by all SLO assessments in all courses at or above 70% success rate.

Share an example of meaningful, innovative, equitable, and/or student-centered SLO assessment happening in your program.

In BOT 180 Basic Computer Skills for Arabic Learners, we use a group capstone project where students work in small groups and use everything learned in the class to complete a PowerPoint presentation on something unique in their culture. Each group presents the final project to the rest of the class including a Q & A session for interaction and feedback.

Discuss how your SLO data are being used for course and/or program improvements for student retention, success, and/or goal achievement.

SLO assessments and discussions have helped us modify our classes and guided us to make changes in the program. In many of the classes students were struggling the publisher's tutorial/assessment software where they have to complete steps to show they have learned a particular skill in Microsoft Office. The program instructions are sometimes difficult to understand, or must be completed in a specific way, and students would get it wrong because they completed it another way. Students were frustrated when they would get something wrong even though they completed it in a way that technically worked but the program still marked it wrong. We increased the number of attempts for each skill which greatly alleviated stress and anxiety over completing these assignments. Students also learn more by having extra attempts so it is a great change resulting from SLO data.

Comprehensive Program Review

Degree and Certificate Programs

For each degree and certificate indicate how many awards were conferred in the past five years. Please comment on any trends and provide context to explain any increases or decreases.

College-wide Degrees Awarded by Academic Year							
Department	Program Title	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23	2023-24	TOTAL
BOT	Administrative Assistant	11	15	10	8	8	52
	Executive Assistant	1	2	0	1	0	4
	Business Office Technology	3	11	3	2	2	21
	TOTAL						77

College-wide Certificates of Achievement Awarded by Academic Year							
Department	Program Title	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23	2023-24	TOTAL
BOT	Administrative Assistant	6	3	5	4	4	22
	Executive Assistant	0	0	0	2	1	3
	Business Office Technology	2	4	1	4	0	11
	Business Information Worker	1	0	0	0	0	1
	TOTAL						37

College-wide Certificates of Specialization Awarded by Academic Year							
Department	Program Title	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	2022-23	2023-24	TOTAL
BOT	Account Clerk	0	4	0	0	0	4
	Front Office Receptionist	4	1	0	2	0	7
	Office Assistant Level I	4	4	1	1	1	11
	Office Assistant Level II	5	5	5	4	2	21
	Office Professional	1	0	1	4	1	7
	Office Software Specialist Level I	5	5	4	5	3	22
	Office Software Specialist Level II	7	0	0	3	0	10
	TOTAL						82

Grand Total		50	54	30	40	22	196
--------------------	--	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	-----------	------------

Indicate when each degree and certificate was last reviewed and updated (semester), if this information is available (e.g., via internal program records or Curriculum Committee minutes).

- Administrative Assistant 10/06/2020
- Executive Assistant 10/06/2020
- Business Office Technology 11/21/2017
- Account Clerk 10/15/2014
- Front Office Receptionist 04/04/2017
- Office Assistant I 10/06/2020
- Office Assistant II 03/06/2001
- Office Professional 10/06/2020
- Office Software Specialist I 10/05/2004
- Office Software Specialist II 10/05/2004
- Business Information Worker 12/16/2015

Can students complete the degree/certificate requirements within a two-year period?

Yes

How is your program currently assessing its PLOs? Please select all that apply.

SLO-to-PLO Mapping

Please provide the following for each degree/certificate: ? The most recent semester each of your program(s) assessed PLOs; ? Brief summary of findings; and ? Overview of changes made as a result.

Program-level SLOs are mapped to course SLOs; therefore, all PLOs are assessed through the course SLO assessment process. Each course is assessed the semester it is offered since most courses are only offered once a year. The results are discussed at the department meeting the following semester.

Are all of your degree maps completed?

Yes

Are the degree maps posted to the college website?

Yes

Comprehensive Program Review

How are you currently assessing your PLOs? If you are not currently assessing PLOs, what is your plan to assess PLOs in the future?

Program-level SLOs are mapped to course SLOs; therefore, all PLOs are assessed through the course SLO assessment process. Each course is assessed the semester it is offered since most courses are only offered once a year. The results are discussed at the department meeting the following semester.

How are your PLO assessments informing improvements/changes to your program?

Because all SLO's and PLO's are successful at 70% or higher, no program changes have been made, but we will continue to monitor it.

Student Access and Achievement

Please describe any enrollment changes (increases/decreases) over the past 4 years and the context for these changes.

Looking at data for the last four years, BOT enrollments in Fall are up 14% and are holding steady for Spring.

BOT does several things to attract students and increase enrollments. We provide materials for 11 courses free to the students, and we just switched publishers to lower costs on the remaining 20 courses to provide equitable access for our students. We also provide textbooks for use while in the BOT lab if a student can't afford the book. We also have books available to loan for the semester. There are no comprehensive OER materials for BOT in part because Microsoft regularly updates their programs and OER materials are incomplete and outdated. Also, there are many robust and comprehensive electronic resources only available from publishers that include videos, guided tutorials, and assessments that are not available other than from a publisher. The new publisher allows students to purchase one access code for use across multiple classes. So, one code could cover 15 classes.

We first offered HyFlex classes last semester to provide students with options that fit their schedules. We adjusted our class rotation schedule so that students could complete a degree in four semesters with a balanced class load each semester.

We send a survey to students regarding scheduling for the following semester and make adjustments to class offerings based on survey results.

We first offered a BOT class specifically for Arabic learners in Spring 2023. This class has been extremely popular with Arabic learners. We did presentations in ESL classes to advertise BOT classes and the extra support we provide to learners who are English as a second language individuals. These students are often not aware of BOT classes. Many of these students have limited computer skills, but by taking a course or two in BOT they will enhance their computer skills which will benefit them in all of their classes and on the job.

If your program has seen a significant decline in enrollment over the past 4 years, what resources or support would be helpful to improve program enrollment and access?

N/A

What is the program doing to increase student enrollment or access?

We have done several things to increase student enrollment and access to our classes. BOT is participating in more outreach events both on and off campus. We have made targeted presentations at El Cajon High School and at the Chaldean Festival. Several new students enrolled as a direct result of these efforts.

BOT faculty and staff manned a table outside the lab during the first two weeks of the semester to help students. We shared information on the BOT program and answered any college-related questions they had.

We translated fliers advertising our classes and degrees into Spanish, Arabic, and Farsi.

What is your program's overall course success rate? How has it changed over the past 4-5 years?

The overall success rate for BOT is 84% in Fall and 83% in Spring. Success rates for the past 5 years has remained fairly consistent. Fall success rates for the past two years are trending up. Spring success rates have one outlier of 75% in 2023, but it rebounded to 91% in 2024. In Spring and Fall 2024 we have had an increase in the number of students coming to the BOT lab for help outside of class.

Which groups are experiencing equity gaps in your program for success rate and/or retention rate?

Looking at BOT data for the past five years, equity gaps exist for African Americans and Hispanics four out of five years. When comparing BOT success rates for African Americans to college-wide success rates, BOT students 5-year average

Comprehensive Program Review

is 81% in Fall (college-wide 63%) and 55% in Spring (college-wide 66%). BOT retention rates for African Americans is 94% in Fall (college-wide 83%) and 69% in Spring (college-wide 82%). For Hispanic BOT students, success rates are 77% in Fall (college-wide 68%) and 77% in Spring (college-wide 71%). BOT retention rates for Hispanic students are 87% in Fall (college-wide 86%) and 82% in Spring (college-wide 85%). This data shows that the five-year average BOT success and retention rates for both African American and Hispanic groups are higher than college averages in the Fall and Spring with the exception of African Americans which are quite a bit lower in the Spring.

What department/discipline (or institutional) factors may be contributing to these lower rates of success for these groups of students?

Regarding the unusually lower success and retention rates for African Americans in Spring semesters, it is difficult to determine the reason for this. Enrollments of African Americans are in single digits each semester and having just 2-3 students who fail or withdraw greatly affects the group averages. For example, in Spring 2023 there were 8 African American students. Four were retained (50% retention), and three successfully completed (38% success). We plan to monitor this situation to see if the trend continues. Additional data is needed, whether through targeted surveys or anecdotal data gathered from talking to African American students in the future

How has this data shaped your comprehensive program review goals and action steps?

BOT will discuss this at their next discipline meeting to determine what steps might be taken if the low rates continue for this group in the spring semester.

Discuss your department/discipline's plan for diversifying department faculty in alignment with the GCCCD Board Resolution 20-015.

BOT has historically been taught by a racially diverse group of instructors. The program is committed to continued diverse hiring practices for both full- and part-time faculty and staff to support student success and equity.

In Fall 2024 the BOT faculty is a diverse group consisting of 3 Chaldeans, 1 Hispanic, and 1 Pacific Islander. Additionally, the BOT support staff is diverse, consisting of 2 Chaldeans and 1 Hispanic.

What other qualitative or quantitative data, if any, is the department/discipline using to inform its planning for this comprehensive program review?

We conduct a survey each semester asking BOT students for feedback on their preferences for scheduling classes, such as class format, length, and days of the week. This is very helpful for planning class schedules that will best serve the needs of the students and avoid class cancellations which severely impacts student completing degrees in a timely manner. See survey attached.

Attach Related Documents - Student Access and Achievement

[2024 10 BOT Student Course Offering Survey.pdf](#)

Distance Education Course Success (If Applicable)

If your department offers distance education classes, how do you ensure Regular and Substantive Interaction (RSI) is being implemented?

Instructors know and understand current effective practices for online teaching that support student success, and apply that knowledge to the design and implementation of the courses. They also know the importance of teacher student communication, and apply this knowledge in various ways to meet the Title 5 requirements for regular and effective contact.

- BOT lab assistants call all students the week prior or the first week of the semester to remind them about specifics of the classes, best option to purchase class materials, cover the technology to be used for their class, login procedures, and answer any questions.
- Instructors hold open office hours via zoom where students can join without making an appointment.
- Discussion boards for specific topics.
- Help discussion board where students and instructor answer questions and help each other.
- Feedback on assignments is provided through rubrics, annotated markup, and feedback comments.
- Instructors contact students throughout the course using Canvas Inbox, email, Canvas gradebook messaging feature, and phone calls when students are inactive or behind on assignments.

In the instructors' own words:

- I write a welcome letter in which I identify myself as a Hispanic Instructor and mention some of the adversities and ethnic assumptions that I have overcome through my entire life.

Comprehensive Program Review

- I write a congratulation comment regarding each assignment that the students have completed. Send a personal email to ask them what is the reason that they didn't do a specific assignment. Met with them in different hours that my office hours are to help them when they need it.
- Reaching out weekly to every student through canvas to "check in" on their thoughts on the class, their progress, questions they might have etc. I encourage all students to come to office hours OR make an appointment on my calendar just to let them see/talk to the instructor in real time. Even if they don't have a question, I encourage them to virtually come say hi and tell me about themselves.
 - Connecting students to the appropriate student services. Reaching out to students to let them know throughout the semester that certain services exist. Posting them on canvas, sending them through announcements etc.
- understanding student backgrounds more through discussion questions that allows me to tailor my interview lessons for example
- I have re-written my syllabus to try to make it more inclusive. I have encouraged students to reach out to the instructor if they are struggling. I refer them to tutorial services for assistance.
- I create recorded video lessons and try to simplify concepts as much as possible. I encourage students to pause, rewind and forward the videos to grasp the concepts. I show students how to enable the closed caption portion of the videos as well as how to access the video transcripts. I provide links for videos on how to use and navigate through Canvas.
- Some students have personal challenges with food insecurity. I posted a list of food distribution sites at local Churches and Charities. There is also a food pantry at the college. There is a also a Cuyamaca Cares program that provide assistance with food, housing, emergency funds and more.
- Using a group in the class between different cultures to help engage students can be helpful to work together to learn more
- Every week I email my students and give them a list of assignments that need to be completed that week. The list is then posted in Announcements for them to review at their leisure.

If there are differences in success rates for distance education (online) versus in-person classes, what will the program do to address these disparities? If there are no differences, what did the program do to achieve that?

The success rate for in-person classes was higher than online. In addition, the average BOT success rate for in-person (93% fall & spring) and online (83% fall, 82% spring) were both higher than the college-wide averages of in-person (76% fall, 79% spring) and online (72% fall, 74% spring). Most BOT classes are short-term online (5-, 6-, and 8-weeks) offered sequentially. BOT has consistently had higher success rates in online classes than the college average and has been commended on this in past program reviews. We believe the short-term scheduling contributes to higher success rates because students stay engaged knowing classes end soon.

Career Exploration and Program Demand (Career Education Programs Only)

Please share your observations about the employment rate for your program over the last 4 years.

The BOT employment rate for the last 4 years is 83%, which is an increase over the average for the seven prior years of 67%.

What is the institution-set standard for your program's employment rate?

The lowest acceptable employment rate for the BOT top code is 67%, which is the average of the seven years ranging from 13-83%.

What would you like your program's employment rate to be, ideally (stretch goal)?

The stretch goal for BOT top code employment rate is 85% which is 2 points above the highest employment rates in the recent two years of data.

What do the latest labor market data reveal about the careers (including those for transfer students) for which your program prepares students?

BOT graduates have a wide range of job opportunities, from entry-level general office clerk to intermediate-level administrative assistant and higher-level executive administrative assistant. Related occupations include receptionist and information clerk, stock clerk, customer service representative, insurance policy processing clerk, library assistant, bill and account collector, hotel desk clerk, bank teller, file clerk, legal secretary, medical secretary, and medical records technician.

The California Employment Development Department (edd.ca.gov). The 2024 median hourly wages for office and administrative support occupations in the San Diego area range from \$23 to \$40 per hour, while the national median hourly wages range from \$18 to \$38.

Comprehensive Program Review

The U.S. Department of Labor shows a bright outlook for three main job groups on the O*NET Online website (www.onetonline.org). A bright outlook designation means it is either a rapidly expanding field or there are over 100,000 openings nationwide.

- Secretaries and Administrative Assistants
- Office Clerks, General
- Receptionists and Information Clerks.

The projected growth from 2022-2032 is -5% nationwide. In California, employment rates are projected to be +3% above national averages for these fields. While growth is declining slightly, projections for the next 10 years show there is a demand for workers due to turnover and retirements.

Attach Related Documents - Career Exploration and Program Demand
[2024 BOT Advisory Board Meeting Minutes.docx](#)

Strengths, Challenges & External Influences

Please describe your program's strengths.

The BOT faculty and staff are like a family. They are dedicated to the students we serve. Students see how supportive everyone is and appreciate how much everyone cares about their success. The number of students coming to the lab for help has increased because of this. Five of the current faculty and staff have been with BOT for over 15 years. Two aides and three faculty are bi-lingual in Arabic and Aramaic, are BOT graduates and serve as role models to the immigrant population. One faculty and one staff member are bi-lingual in Spanish.

Please describe your program's challenges.

BOT has a higher percentage of females in the program. This is a Perkins metric that we have been focusing on for years with a goal of increasing the number of male students taking our courses. Various efforts have not made any great changes. The reality is that this job field is predominantly made up of women, where nationwide 78% of jobs are held by women and 22% by men. BOT enrollments close mirror this trend.

We are uncertain how future enrollment management strategies might affect a smaller program like BOT where we already offer most classes only once a year. Cancelling classes can have a devastating effect on students trying to complete a degree in a timely manner.

Please describe external influences that affect your program (both positively and negatively).

The collaboration with Arabic Studies has had a positive affect on BOT enrollments because after taking BOT 180 Basic Computer Skills for Arabic Learners, several students go on to complete a BOT Certificate of Specialization. Many of those students were not even aware of the BOT classes or certificates otherwise.

Given these factors, what opportunities exist for the service area to advance the College's goals in the next 4 years?

Many opportunities exist to improve student success and equity in the BOT program. One faculty participated in the Equity Minded Teaching and Learning Institute. We encourage faculty to participate in equity-minded training and are looking to have a cohort participate in the Equity Pedagogy and Practice Academy, or something similar.

Program Goals

Program Goals Status

Updated progress on my previous goals & added new.

Program Goals Mapping

Mapping for all active Program Goals complete.

Submission
